

Tabulation for 2012-2013 TPA Proposal

Selection Criteria	Wt	IMS	BCBSTX	Caprock	First Care	Group Resources (NW Mutual)	Davis Ins. - Bakers Benefit
Total Proposed Pricing							
1. Admin Med & Dental, Case Mgmt, Pre-Cert	10%	10.00	4.37	7.75	6.67	5.73	6.45
2. Reinsurance Cost Specific Prem. & Aggregate	10%	7.81	9.12	8.95	8.21	7.30	10.00
3. Attachment Point/Max Liability	10%	8.04	8.33	8.59	10.00	7.83	8.47
4. Re-Priced Claims/ CPT Codes	10%	7.25	9.94	7.59	7.25	10.00	0.00
Sub-Total: for Costs	40%	33.10	31.76	32.88	32.13	30.86	24.92
Comments:		Guaranteed Admin costs for 2yrs Renegotiated contract with Nwth Guaranteed reinsurance quote, no laser	Cobra is flat \$75mo or \$10mo per participant Reinsurance quote not guaranteed, possible laser (contingency)	\$2950 initial set up fee, Guaranteed Admin costs for 2yrs	Add'l \$250 set up for debit card for flex spending accts, Aggregate is for \$910000 not \$950,000	\$4000 initial set up fee	Add'l \$3 pepm to "service" employee benefit acct
Qualifications & Experience							
1. Case Mgmt & Pre-Cert Program	10%	9.00	10.00	7.00	7.00	8.00	5.00

Selection Criteria	Wt	IMS	BCBSTX	Caprock	First Care	Group Resources (NW Mutual)	Davis Ins. - Bakers Benefit
Comments:		Included in Admin Fee In-House 1 nurse for case mgmt	Included in Admin Fee In-House	Outsourced to Hines & Assoc. \$155 per hr	Case Mgmt listed as \$145 & \$155hr in response	Out Sourced to INetiCare \$130 per hr	Hourly Rate for Case Mgmt. No amount given.
2. Financial Stability	10%	10.00	10.00	6.00	4.00	0.00	0.00
Comments:				Will supply if selected finalist, cannot rate financials since not submitted, A+ rating	Financial Statement shows loss for last 2 yrs B Rated stop loss	Cannot rate financials, were not submitted	Nothing submitted in proposal response
3. Demonstrated prior experience in providing similar service & references	10%	10.00	9.00	9.00	7.00	8.00	0.00
Comments:			Would have to change networks 1% of clients are self-funded Possible issue following RC plan doc	Avg. claim processed 10-15 days Would have to change networks based on CPT codes	Low rating on customer service & plan pricing per own suvey 8% clients are self-funded	No Transpant Rider quoted w/ proposal (can get quote for one) 98+% claims pd 10days	Nothing submitted in proposal response

Selection Criteria	Wt	IMS	BCBSTX	Caprock	First Care	Group Resources (NW Mutual)	Davis Ins. - Bakers Benefit
4. Capability to provide responsive service service hours & reporting capabilities	10%	10.00	9.00	9.00	9.00	9.00	0.00
Comments:		Have customized reports for County H.R.	Reports do not have all features needed, may be resolved working with them	Mentioned Potter Co in proposal 3 times	Checks mailed from Missouri	Reports do not have all features needed, may be resolved working with them	Nothing submitted in proposal response
Sub Total for Qualifications	40%	39.00	38.00	31.00	27.00	25.00	5.00
Proposed Services meeting Randall County's requirements							
1. Adherence to requirments of RFP	5%	5.00	5.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	2.00
2. Offeror's responsibility clearly defined	5%	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	1.00
3. County's participation & responsibility clearly defined	5%	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	1.00
4. Demonstrated ability to fully meet the needs of county	5%	5.00	3.00	4.00	4.00	3.00	1.00

Selection Criteria	Wt	IMS	BCBSTX	Caprock	First Care	Group Resources (NW Mutual)	Davis Ins. - Bakers Benefit
Comments:			Does not provide Medical/child-care reimbursement, no transplant policy	Did not submit financials	No transplant premium quoted different reinsurance amount quoted	No transplant premium avail, no financials submitted, does not prepare government docs	Did not submit all aspects of RFP
Sub Total for Proposed Service	20%	20.00	18.00	18.00	18.00	17.00	5.00
SELECTION CRITERIA EVALUATION	100%	92.10	87.76	81.88	77.13	72.86	34.92